

Annotation of Culturally Responsive and Sustaining Education Facilitator Guide

This Annotation Guide is a complement to the [Culturally Responsive and Sustaining Education Facilitator's Guide](#) designed by NYC's Culturally Responsive and Sustaining Working Group and in conjunction with New York University's Metro Center. The Facilitator's Guide is structured as a series of 10 discussion-based professional learning sessions. This Annotation Guide is meant to serve as a "how-to" for HEI tutoring providers as they use the Facilitator's Guide to support the development of culturally responsive and sustaining HEI tutors. It is recommended that HEI tutoring providers read and ground themselves in the [Facilitator's Guide](#) *prior* to engaging with the Annotation Guide.

Feedback on the Annotation Guide's utility is continually welcomed and encouraged [here](#). HEI providers are also encouraged to reach out directly to [NYC's Culturally Responsive Sustaining Working Group](#) for specific questions related to the Facilitator's Guide they developed. For other questions related to content and professional development matters consider reaching out to [NYU's Metro Center](#) for ongoing support and guidance.

The context used to inform this guide, and within which tutors operate, is as follows:

1. High-Impact tutoring supplements (but does not replace) students' classroom experiences
2. High-impact tutoring responds to individual needs and complements students' existing curriculum
3. Students work with a consistent tutor who is supported by ongoing oversight and coaching
4. Tutoring sessions include a minimum of three sessions per week in individual or small groups
5. High-impact tutoring is embedded in schools either during the school day or immediately before or after the school day
6. High-Impact tutoring programs are grounded in Equity, ensure Safety of students and program elements and leadership work together creating a Cohesive well-run program

Term Definitions

Tutor - an HEI student who is working as a tutor for K-12 students

HEI - higher education institution which may include community colleges, four-year colleges and universities

HEI tutoring provider - an HEI that operates or provides tutors for a tutoring program for K-12 students

Additional Considerations/Recommendations

- HEI tutoring providers dedicate one day per month for engaging in Sessions 1-10 and create and share a calendar with HEI students in advance (if and where possible) to note session dates.
- As the Facilitator Guide states on page 7, sessions are at least 90 minutes in length to allow HEI students (tutors) to have thoughtful engagement with the material (specific time applications are included in the Facilitator Guide as additional guidance).

-
- HEI tutoring providers create a special seminar class for Sessions 1-10 where HEI students (tutors) receive extra credit to incentivize engagement and attendance.
 - HEI tutoring providers invite CR-SE experts from their respective fields and external speakers from the community (including families and students served by the program) to highlight key ideas and themes from the session (guidance for optimal moments to invite guest speakers are provided within the Annotation Guide).
 - HEI tutoring providers email out pre-work (at least) 3 weeks in advance to encourage thoughtful HEI student (tutor) engagement. The email outlines how much time HEI students (tutors) can expect to dedicate to the pre-work (i.e., Facilitator Guide notes 90-120 minutes of pre-work).

Opening Frame (p. 1-2)

The [Culturally Responsive-Sustaining Education Facilitators Guide](#) designed by NYC's Culturally Responsive Working Group in conjunction with [New York University's Metro Center](#) is a resource designed to engage education stakeholders, including HEI students (tutors), in furthering their development as culturally responsive and sustaining practitioners. HEI tutoring providers are encouraged to use this resource in their unique contexts as designed as it represents collective thinking from students, educators, policymakers, researchers, community members, and parents on how to develop the orientations, mindsets, behaviors and habits of stakeholders committed to equity and justice and delivering a culturally responsive and sustaining education to students. This document uses a lens typically associated with teachers and school-based staff, and as a result, must be used in conjunction with a grounded understanding of the context and setting where HEI tutoring is occurring. Places where such considerations exist, brief annotations for how HEI tutoring providers can make informed decisions based upon their tutoring context is included.

Opening + Table of Contents (p. 3-4)

The opening and table of contents provide an outline of the goals of the Culturally Responsive Working Group, information on the specific members of the group as well as the table of contents that reveal the range of topics for discussion contained in the Facilitator Guide. HEI tutoring providers can skip to different topics throughout the interactive guide to learn more about a particular session topic. The majority of the resources contain active links to readings, videos and other sources of information.

Introduction (p. 5)

The introduction narrates the origin of the guide by the NYC Culturally Responsive Education Working Group, a committed body desiring to see culturally responsive and sustaining educational practices applied throughout New York City's public schools. The introduction asserts that those who desire to improve the educational outcomes of the city's most vulnerable populations, a vulnerability created by the historical and ongoing experiences of racism, xenophobia and oppression, and that serves as the root cause for predictable achievement patterns across differing racial, cultural, and linguistic groups. The hopes of the working group are included and HEI tutoring providers are encouraged to read, reflect and draw connections to their own tutoring work. It marks an opportunity for HEI tutoring providers to share these hopes with HEI students (tutors) as they develop as culturally responsive and sustaining practitioners.

Preparing to Facilitate (p. 6-8)

All HEI tutoring providers are encouraged to review the section “Preparing to Facilitate” as it outlines key considerations for HEI tutoring providers regardless of facilitation skills. Specifically, it provides support on how to gather people and how to use the guide. HEI tutoring providers that create smaller learning experiences for their HEI students (tutors) through peer learning communities (PLCs) facilitated by HEI tutoring providers may find this guide useful for those types of structured learning environments. The guide names unequivocally the work of being a culturally responsive and sustaining educator requires the discussion of race. The discussion guide highlights a process to support HEI tutoring program facilitators and HEI students (tutors) in this effort. The guide also highlights the purpose behind session structure (sessions move in an intentional progression from Session 1 to Session 10 with a similar flow) as well as other key features of gathering including circle format, discussion protocols and key takeaways. HEI tutoring providers will have to make individual assessments about which sessions their facilitators deliver as some sessions may fall outside the scope of HEI student’s (tutor’s) direct responsibilities (see Session 6: CRSE + Relationships: Family and Community as an example).

Session 1: Setting the Foundation for Anti-Racist Work and Conversation (p. 9-10)

Session 1 reveals how culturally responsive and sustaining education (CR-SE) is a form of anti-racism work that serves as a critical method for practicing equity within the context of schooling. HEI tutoring providers committed to equity are encouraged to prioritize building a community of learners amongst HEI students (tutors); a community built on trusting relationships since this is foundational for (1) honest and frank conversations about race and racism and (2) developing as culturally responsive and sustaining tutors. For HEI tutoring providers what this can mean is building intentional time during seminars (or other structures) for HEI students (tutors) to develop deeper connections with their colleagues. Session 1 is an important session that affords HEI tutoring providers this critical opportunity.

Additional considerations for HEI tutoring providers are included below.

- **PRE-WORK:** Community agreements set the foundation for a budding learning community to honestly share and develop trusting relationships. HEI tutoring providers can consider the below resources as supplemental pre-work to the recommendations within the Facilitator Guide. The additional pre-work supports HEI students (tutors) in developing collectively chosen community agreements that support them in sharing honestly and in facilitating deeper relationships with their colleagues.
 - **HEI students (tutors) are encouraged to complete both the pre-work assigned in the Facilitator Guide and the below additional pre-work to support creating Community Agreements:**
 - “Guidelines” and “Safer Space” from [Dismantling Racism](#) (p. 6 from [Dismantling Racism’s Workbook](#)).
 - **HEI students (tutors) answer pre-work reflection questions related to the Community Agreements and come to Session 1 prepared to discuss:**
 - Which of these agreements (or guidelines) **resonate** with you?
 - Which ones will be **difficult** for you?

- Which agreement (guidelines) do you **need** for a “Safer Space” so that you can have honest conversations with your colleagues?
- **HEI students (tutors) read:** “[Courageous Conversations About Race Protocol](#).”

Session 2: Understanding Racism + Oppression (p.11-12)

Practicing equity through being a culturally responsive and sustaining HEI student (tutor) requires developing a complex understanding of racism as a system and structure that creates group-based advantages and disadvantages based upon characteristics like race, ethnicity, skin color, language, gender-identity, socioeconomic class and more. Session 2 offers HEI tutoring programs a method for introducing this structural understanding to HEI students (tutors) by introducing what’s commonly referred to as the 4Is of racism. The resources show how racism (in combination with other exclusionary structures like heterosexism, classism, religious oppression and ableism) create the context for **why** an anti-racist educational approach (i.e., culturally responsive and sustaining education) is the necessary approach for HEI students (tutors).

- **PRE-WORK:**

- HEI tutoring programs provide **three** different resources to serve as additional pre-work material for Session 2 so that HEI students (tutors) can develop shared language and (at minimum) a *working* understanding of racism and oppression as structures that impact both their lives and their students’ lives.
 - 4Is of Racism located [here](#).
 - 4Is of Oppression located [here](#)
 - HEI students (tutors) choose and watch a total of three videos from [Race Forward’s](#) “What is Systemic Racism?” series, an 8-part video series that shows how racism shows up in our lives across institutions and society: Wealth Gap, Employment, Housing Discrimination, Government Surveillance, Incarceration, Drug Arrests, Immigration Arrests, Infant Mortality.
 - **Watch:** “[What is systemic racism?](#)” with introduction from Renku Sen.
 - **Watch:** Eight-video series (~1 min/video).
 - **Reflect:** What is similar across the different examples? What is different across the different examples?

Session 3: Introduction to Culturally Responsive and Sustaining Education (p.13-15)

Session 3 introduces HEI students (tutors) to culturally responsive and sustaining education as a pedagogical framework for anti-racist teaching. HEI tutoring providers are encouraged to support HEI students (tutors) in learning and understanding key terms and ideas, and analyzing how CR-SE as a framework can be applied to a HEI student (tutor) context.

- **ADDITIONAL RESOURCES:** HEI tutoring providers prioritize [The Equity Rubric](#) from the organization, [Bright Morning](#). Specific rubric domains and indicators most pertinent to an HEI student (tutor) context are highlighted and suggested below for HEI tutoring providers.
 - **HEI students (tutors) review:** [Equity Rubric](#) including the rubric domains and specific indicators provided.
 - I. Teacher Beliefs (p. 3 Indicators 1-7)



- II. Relationships and Culture (p. 4-5 Indicators 1-9, 11-14)
- III. Class Environment (p. 6 Indicators 1-8)
- IV. Rigor and Expectations (p. 7 Indicators 1-7)
- V. Access and Participation (p. 8-9 Indicators 1-7, 10-11)
- VI. Student Performance (p. 9-10 Indicators 1-6)
- VII. Curriculum and Instruction (p. 1-7, 9, 11-14)
- **HEI students (tutors) rate themselves on the “Teacher Beliefs” and “Relationships and Culture” [Equity rubric](#) domains as post-session work for discussion in Session 3.**
 - What 2-3 rubric strands were **strengths** for you?
 - Which 2-3 rubric strands represent **areas for growth**?
 - What is one thing that **challenged** you?
 - What is one way this will be **useful** for you as an HEI student (tutor)?

Session 4: CR-SE & Me: Personal, Local and Immediate (p. 16-17)

Session 4 establishes a personal, local, and immediate context for HEI tutoring providers and their HEI students (tutors) to discuss race and racism. Within this session HEI students (tutors) share their own racial autobiography which serves as an analytical tool for examining the impact of race and racism in their own lives. The lens HEI students (tutors) develop is then extended to analyze and discuss the ways in which race and racism play out in the lives of students and communities. Additional considerations for pre-work and community circle are provided below.

- **PRE-WORK:** HEI tutoring providers have HEI students (tutors) craft their stories in advance of the session to allow for more thoughtful engagement with their stories. The utility and power of racial autobiographies comes from the personal archaeological analysis done by HEI students (tutors), which creates the conditions for a more complex and nuanced understanding about race and racism in their lives and the lives of their students.
 - **HEI students (tutors) write a response to the following:** What are your personal experience(s) with race? What impact does race have on your own life? When was the first time you noticed your racial identity?
 - **(OPTIONAL) HEI students (tutors) read:** “The First Condition: Getting Personal Right Here, Right Now” (p. 87-91 from [Courageous Conversations About Race: A Field Guide for Racial Equity](#), 2nd Edition).
- **OPENING COMMUNITY CIRCLE:** HEI tutoring providers use community circle to revisit the additional resources from Session 3’s post-work to reflect on the [Equity Rubric](#) before diving into the remainder of the session.
 - **HEI tutoring providers ask:** Choose one reflection question from the postwork for discussion in the community circle.
 - What 2-3 rubric strands from the [Equity Rubric](#) were **strengths** for you?
 - Which 2-3 rubric strands represent **areas for growth**?
 - What is one thing that **challenged** you?
 - What is one way this rubric can be **useful** for you as an HEI student (tutor)?

Session 5: CR-SE & Relationships: Teachers, Staff & Students (p. 18-19)

Session 5 encourages HEI tutoring providers to work with HEI students (tutors) to commit to building positive **relationships with teachers, staff, and students** given relationship-building is a central role in being a culturally responsive and sustaining HEI student (tutor). This session offers an opportunity for HEI tutoring providers to invite guest speakers that include students, teachers, and school-based staff to help orient HEI students (tutors) to the importance of building trusting relationships with these critical stakeholders. Additional considerations in regards to pre-work and additional resources for Session 5 are also provided below.

- **PRE-WORK:** HEI tutoring providers use the [CR-SE Framework](#) to highlight the responsibilities of HEI students (tutors) in creating a warm and welcoming environment for their students. HEI tutoring providers review p. 26: “Creating a Welcoming and Affirming Environment” to focus HEI students (tutors) on the actions of a teacher, the role most aligned to their own responsibilities. HEI tutoring providers with sessions longer than 90 minutes can also review the indicators on p. 20, 32, and 33 of the CR-SE Framework to provide space for HEI students (tutors) to explore the complexity of the larger school-based ecosystem.
 - **HEI students (tutors) read:** [CR-SE Framework: Creating a Welcoming and Affirming Environment](#) (p. 26)
 - **HEI students (tutors) read and answer reflection questions in advance of the session:**
 - What are the different relationships that exist in school?
 - What power dynamics might come into play in those relationships?
 - In what ways can we proactively build and nurture these relationships?
- **ADDITIONAL RESOURCES:** HEI tutoring providers can extend the learning from Session 5 by incorporating these additional resources into the series.
 - **Guest speakers:** HEI tutoring providers can use this session as an opportunity to further orient HEI students (tutors) to relationship-building by inviting a panel of **students, teachers, and school-based staff** from current schools where HEI students are tutoring. HEI tutoring providers are encouraged to make panels manageable in size and to uplift a diverse range of voices that represent multiple student, teacher, and staff-based perspectives. HEI tutoring providers are encouraged to consider the needs of panelists to ensure an inclusive space.
 - **Key things to consider:** Sharing questions to panelists in advance, time of day, accessibility, childcare, financial compensation, providing meals etc., in addition to having a translator and ASL interpreter on hand for bi/multilingual panelists. Ideal panel sizes range from 4-6 people with an equal distribution of students and teachers.

Session 6: CR-SE and Relationships: Families and Communities (p. 20-22)

Session 6 builds from Session 5 by centering HEI students (tutors) on **relationships with families and communities**. As HEI tutoring providers support HEI students (tutors) to commit to culturally responsive and sustaining practices, HEI tutoring providers are encouraged to implement this session from the series regardless of whether HEI students (tutors) have direct engagement with families. It is important for HEI students (tutors) to view families through a warm, affirming, welcoming and sustaining lens as families are integral sources of knowledge when it comes to their students. Finding

methods to harness that information in service of learning is how tutors can continue to develop as culturally responsive and sustaining practitioners. Additional resources to support HEI students (tutors) to demonstrate asset-based approaches to families are provided below.

- **ADDITIONAL RESOURCES:**

- **Guest speakers:** HEI tutoring providers can use this session as an opportunity to further orient HEI students (tutors) to relationship-building by inviting a panel of **parents, families, and community members** to share with HEI students (tutors). Its recommended panelists come from partnership schools where HEI tutoring partners have existing relationships in order to ground HEI students (tutors) in their local context. Panels are encouraged to be manageable in size and uplift a diverse range of voices that represent **multiple family and community perspectives**. HEI tutoring providers are also encouraged to consider the needs of panelists to ensure an inclusive space.
 - **Key things to consider:** Sharing questions to panelists in advance, time of day, accessibility, childcare, financial compensation, providing meals etc., in addition to having a translator and ASL interpreter on hand for bi/multilingual panelists. Ideal panel sizes range from 4-6 people with an equal distribution of family and community representation.

Session 7/8: CRSE, Curriculum and Pedagogy (p. 23-26)

Session 7 examines the importance of high expectations and rigorous instruction along with the role of inclusive curriculum and assessments in a culturally responsive and sustaining classroom. HEI students (tutors) not may not have decision-making power when it comes to curriculum selection, but HEI tutoring programs are encouraged to include this session in the professional development series. Empowering HEI students (tutors) with knowledge of what inclusive curriculum and assessments can look and sound like will empower them to be *humble* advocates for students and families when they perceive and/or experience misalignment between the principles and practices of CRSE within their tutoring context. Additional considerations for pre-work are included below.

- **PRE-WORK:** HEI tutoring programs can select specific indicators from the [CR-SE Framework](#) to support HEI students (tutors) in applying the framework’s “Fostering High Expectations and Rigorous Instruction” and “Inclusive Curriculum & Assessment” approach to their work. The Facilitator Guide offers discussion questions included below to increase HEI students’ (tutors’) meaningful engagement with the material.
 - **HEI students (tutors) read indicators:** [“Fostering High Expectations and Rigorous Instruction”](#) (CR-SE Framework p.27).
 - **HEI students (tutors) read:** [“Inclusive Curriculum and Assessment”](#) (CR-SE Framework p.28).
 - **HEI students (tutors) pre-work reflection questions to answer in advance of session based on reading pages 27-28 in the [CR-SE Framework](#):**
 - Based on the CR-SE Framework, where are we as an institution and as individuals upholding the beliefs and practices of fostering high expectations and rigorous instruction? Identifying inclusive curriculum and assessment?
 - Where are we falling short?

-
- What are some elements that have challenged us in meeting these expectations? What are some possible solutions to those challenges?
 - What do we need in order to make progress and meet the needs of our students?
 - What can you do to better meet the needs of students? What is within your locus of control?

Session 9: CRSE and Disrupting Systems of Inequity (p. 27-28)

Session 9 asks HEI students (tutors) to zoom out and reflect on the larger educational system and the disruptions necessary to center a culturally responsive and sustaining education for students (intentionally) marginalized and made vulnerable by the current educational system. Additional considerations for community agreements and extended learning activities are provided below to support HEI students (tutors).

- **COMMUNITY AGREEMENTS:**
 - **HEI students (tutors) re-read:** “Guidelines” and “Safer Space” from Dismantling Racism (p. 6 from [Dismantling Racism’s Workbook](#)).
- **ADDITIONAL RESOURCES:** HEI tutoring programs use the session as an opportunity to create a community-based panel featuring different local grassroots organizations. The purpose of the panel is to support HEI students (tutors) in understanding the interconnectedness of educational injustice and how communities exercise agency by fighting for and demanding justice in the face of these inequities.
 - **HEI tutoring providers convene a community-based panel that represent the following:**
 - Community-based organizations (including community elders)
 - Faith-based organizations
 - Parent/Family advocacy organizations
 - Student organizations
 - Consider inquiring with your HEI’s community service or volunteer office to see if they may be able to support you in putting this together.

Session 10: Closing (p. 29-30)

Session 10 provides HEI students (tutors) an opportunity to audit their tutoring context and plan for next steps in their own development. HEI tutoring providers are encouraged to prepare HEI students (tutors) for self-assessment by encouraging HEI students (tutors) to revisit the [Equity Rubric](#) where HEI students (tutors) can evaluate their growth and determine next steps in their development. Discussion questions are shared in advance as supplemental pre-work in order to support these goals. Additional supports for the session are provided below.

- **PRE-WORK:**
 - **HEI students (tutors) review:** Rubric domains and indicators from the [Equity Rubric](#).
 - I. Teacher Beliefs (p. 3 Indicators 1-7)
 - II. Relationships and Culture (p. 4-5 Indicators 1-9, 11-14)
 - III. Class Environment (p. 6 Indicators 1-8)



- IV. Rigor and Expectations (p. 7 Indicators 1-7)
- V. Access and Participation (p. 8-9 Indicators 1-7, 10-11)
- VI. Student Performance (p. 9-10 Indicators 1-6)
- VII. Curriculum and Instruction (p. 1-7, 9, 11-14)
- **HEI students (tutors) evaluate themselves on the “*Teacher Beliefs*” and “*Relationships and Culture*” domains and reflect on the following questions:**
 - What are you noticing based on your audit? How does this compare to your initial ratings? What do you feel proud of? What was surprising?
 - What are 1-2 next steps for you?
 - How can you increase your spheres of influence? What places and spaces can you become a part of to support your personal and professional growth?